



# Report of a Quality Review of Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau

November 2015

## Contents

Preface .....	1
Background.....	1
Conduct of the Institutional Review of Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau .....	1
Executive summary.....	2
Introduction .....	2
Explanation of the review methodology.....	2
Summary of the principal findings .....	2
Good practice .....	3
Recommendations .....	3
Introduction to the College and its role and mission .....	4
1 The setting and maintenance of academic standards .....	6
Programme design, development and approval .....	6
Programme monitoring and review.....	7
External examining .....	8
2 The quality of learning opportunities .....	9
Learning and teaching.....	9
Student support and development .....	10
Assessment .....	11
Student engagement in quality assurance.....	12
Student achievement .....	12
3 Published Information.....	15
4 Quality enhancement.....	16
5 Conclusions.....	18
6 Institutional response to the review findings .....	19
Glossary.....	20

## Preface

### Background

The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (QAA) was commissioned by Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau (the College) to undertake an external review of the College's management of academic standards and quality assurance.

QAA's object is the promotion and maintenance of quality and standards in higher education in the UK and elsewhere, and the provision of information and the publication of reports on quality and standards in higher education in the UK and elsewhere.

### Conduct of the Institutional Review of Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau

The primary aim of the review is to assist the College in safeguarding standards and assuring the quality of the student learning experience.

The approach to the review is based on the principle of fitness for purpose. The review team assesses the extent to which the institution is fulfilling its stated mission and purpose, and confirms the procedures in place for assuring the quality of the learning opportunities offered to students and the academic standards by which students' level of performance and capability are assessed and reported. The review also examines the effectiveness of the institution's quality systems and considers the evidence used to demonstrate that these systems meet the expectations of stakeholders. The underpinning framework that guides the review is the *Approach - Deployment - Results - Improvement* (ADRI) Framework<sup>1</sup>.

The review was undertaken by a team of three reviewers appointed by QAA. The team comprised local and overseas academics. All reviewers hold, or have held, senior positions within their professions. Overseas reviewers are experienced in quality audit in higher education. The audit process is therefore one of peer review.

---

<sup>1</sup> SAI Global Limited (2007) *The Business Excellence Framework*, SAI Global Limited, Sydney p 32.

## Executive summary

### Introduction

#### Explanation of the review methodology

This is the report of a quality assurance review of Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau (the College) by a review team appointed by, and acting on behalf of, the Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (QAA). It is based on a self-evaluation which was prepared by the College following a period of self review and submitted to QAA on 25 August 2015. A desk-based analysis of the self-evaluation and associated documentary evidence was conducted, and was followed by a three-day visit to the College by the team.

The review team (the team) visited Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau on 10-12 November 2015 and met the College President, the Vice Chair of the Board of Directors, senior academic staff, students past and present, teaching staff, administrative and support staff and a range of other key stakeholders, including those who subsequently employ students of the College.

The review was conducted by a team of three reviewers:

- Professor Chan Yip Wing Han Carmen
- Associate Professor Chow Yeow Leng
- Mr Alan Weale (also Review Coordinator).

The review team evaluated:

- the setting and maintenance of academic standards
- the quality of student learning opportunities, including consideration of student achievement
- the accuracy and currency of published information and its usefulness
- the approach to the enhancement of the quality of learning opportunities.

The team identified features of good practice and made recommendations for improvement. For an explanation of terms see the [glossary](#) at the end of this report.

#### Summary of the principal findings

The QAA review team formed the following judgements about the higher education provision at the Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau.

- **Confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the academic standards of its awards.
- **Confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the quality of the learning opportunities available to students.
- **Confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the information it produces about its higher education provision.
- **Confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the enhancement of the quality of learning opportunities available to students.

## Good practice

The QAA review team identified the following features of **good practice** at Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau:

- the wide range of staff development opportunities facilitated by the College, which enable effective professional and personal development (paragraph 2.6)
- the extensive range of support for student learning, in particular the work of the Benevolence Education Centre (paragraph 2.13)
- the highly effective strategies for networking and communication between the College and clinical practice (paragraph 2.16)
- the achievement of high levels of graduate employment and the proportion of graduates pursuing further study (paragraph 2.27).

## Recommendations

The QAA review team makes the following **recommendations** to Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau:

- explicitly publicise the language of teaching and assessment for each subject (paragraph 2.15)
- explore alternative strategies to provide opportunities for interprofessional learning (paragraph 2.17)
- clarify the criteria for reassessment of subjects and ensure these are explicitly set out in the regulations for the programme (paragraph 2.18).

## Introduction to the College and its role and mission

Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau (the College), formerly known as Kiang Wu Nursing and Midwifery School, is a subsidiary of Kiang Wu Hospital Charitable Association (KWHCA), founded in 1923. In 1989, the Macau government formally recognised the School as an education institution. On 5 November 1999, the School was officially renamed Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau.

Kiang Wu Nursing College's philosophy is rooted in its founder's tradition of caring and devotion and the educational philosophy of From Personhood to Benevolence. The objectives pursued by the College are to cultivate nursing and health sciences professionals who believe in the philosophy of From Personhood to Benevolence and who show dedication to the nation and human health by creating new knowledge, caring for and benefiting the local communities.

The College's mission is to implement its objectives and educational philosophy through setting up a multi-tiered and compound system of programmes that centre on nursing science in coordination with other health disciplines, and to adopt the three-in-one policy of Professional Education, Holistic Education and General Education for preparing nursing and health sciences professionals who 'Strive for Competence and Integrity, Serve with Professionalism and Care' and endeavour to develop a local foothold as well as an international vision.

The School developed its Higher Diploma in Nursing programme in 1997. In response to social development and a growing demand for high-quality nursing services, the College planned a four-year Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme in 2002, the first full-time pre-registration bachelor's nursing programme in Macau. It replaced the higher diploma programme. The first cohort graduated in 2005. The latest revision of the programme was undertaken in 2011.

With the increasing demand for high quality nursing and in response to the needs of continuous nursing education opportunities for nurses in Macau, the School collaborated with School of Nursing of Peking Union Medical College to offer the in-service Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme in 1999, which was the first post-registration programme in Macau. In 2001, the College offered its Higher Diploma in Nursing (Supplementary) programme for working nurses. In 2002, the Higher Diploma in Nursing (Supplementary) programme was phased out and the College was approved by the Government to start the two-year part-time Bachelor of Science in Nursing (Supplementary) programme. The programme has run since the academic year 2004-05.

In 2008, with developments in health services and nursing services in Macau, the Secretary for Social Affairs and Culture agreed to the College's collaboration with the Hospital Authority of Hong Kong to offer the Postgraduate Diploma in Advanced Nursing programme to prepare specialist nurses. In 2010, the College, with the support of the Macau government, jointly offered the Master of Nursing Science programme with the Sun Yat-sen University, China.

For the past decade until the current academic year (2014-15), the College has prepared 774 graduates from various levels of nursing programmes. There are 497 graduates from the Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme, 214 graduates from the Bachelor of Science in Nursing (Supplementary) programme, 47 graduates from the Postgraduate Diploma in Advanced Nursing programme and 16 graduates from the Master of Nursing Science programme.

At the time of the review, the College ran two nursing programmes, namely the Bachelor of Science in Nursing for secondary school graduates (with 278 registered students) and the Bachelor of Science in Nursing Supplementary programme for diploma-prepared nurses (with 31 registered students). The Postgraduate Diploma in Advanced Nursing programme and the Master of Nursing Science programme had no intake of students.

## 1 The setting and maintenance of academic standards

1.1 The College's ability to confer degrees and diplomas is set out in the College Statutes. The setting and maintenance of academic standards is the ultimate responsibility of the Academic Committee. Academic awards are made by the College through the Accreditation Monitoring Group of Academic Committee. The President and Chair of the Board of Directors jointly sign all award certificates.

### **Programme design, development and approval**

1.2 The programme planning committee is responsible for the development of programmes. Processes and guidelines for developing and approving programmes are set out in the College Quality Assurance Handbook. The College President assigns a programme leader to plan the programme. The designated programme leader is tasked with drafting a programme proposal. The proposal is then discussed at the Education Department meeting before being submitted to the College Administrative Committee for consideration of resource implications. The Academic Committee, which includes external professional experts, comments on the proposal in terms of its academic quality and, if appropriate, endorses the proposal. Once the proposal is approved at the College level, the programme is submitted to the Tertiary Education Service Office of Macau, representing the Macau Special Administrative Region (SAR) government, for final approval. The programme details are published in the definitive programme document, which acts as the single source of information for the subsequent delivery of the programme.

1.3 The team evaluated the effectiveness of programme design, development and approval by reviewing policy documents, including the Quality Assurance Handbook, minutes of relevant meetings and definitive course documents. The team also held discussions with staff, students and stakeholders and undertook visits to clinical areas.

1.4 In keeping with the College's mission and values, initiation of the undergraduate and postgraduate programmes is grounded on meeting the needs and demands of the local communities, changes in demography, and pattern of healthcare needs, as well as globalisation initiatives. Curricula are developed to provide educational opportunities for students to gain relevant and current knowledge, skills and attitudes to function competently upon graduation; this is in alignment with the College philosophy. Aims, objectives and contents of the subjects within the programme are designed and planned by teachers with relevant expertise.

1.5 In addition to preparing students to meet the skill set required to meet local needs, the learning outcomes and core competencies are based on the International Council of Nurses competency framework and benchmarked against neighbouring regions. Broad learning activities such as extracurricular activities are also incorporated in the programmes.

1.6 Stakeholders such as employers, past graduates, professional organisations, governmental agencies, faculty and current students are widely consulted and participate directly and indirectly in structuring the programme through a wide range of feedback systems. This is shown by the introduction of subjects such as community care, aged care and research in both theory and practice, which reflect current societal and demographic changes.

1.7 Although Macau does not have a national framework for the accreditation of nursing programmes, approval to run the programme is only granted by the Tertiary Education Service Office of Macau following consultation with the Health Bureau of the Macau government on the basis of programme validation by the College and by international experts, as well as adherence to the requirements of the Macau Special Administrative

Region (SAR) Government. The Higher Diploma in Nursing programme was established in 1997 and was upgraded to a four-year Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme in 2002. Both were validated by international and regional nursing experts.

1.8 The team formed the view that programme design, development and approval processes are fit for purpose and rigorously applied. Programme leaders drafted programme revision plans, which were discussed in teachers' meetings and examined by the Programme Committee. Meetings of the Education Department ensured that programmes meet internal professional academic standards, while the Academic Committee ensured academic validation by external experts before submission to the Tertiary Education Service Office, Macau for final approval to run the programmes. In addition to setting academic standards, programme approval takes into account feedback from the College Administrative Committee, which is responsible for ensuring financial provision, resources in the form of facilities and manpower, as well administrative support, which are important factors in ensuring the feasibility of running quality programmes.

### **Programme monitoring and review**

1.9 The procedures for ongoing internal monitoring and the periodic review of programmes are set out in the College Quality Assurance Handbook.

1.10 The team tested the effectiveness of these procedures through an analysis of the relevant policies and procedures as set out in the College Quality Assurance Handbook. Minutes of committee meetings were read and reports of monitoring and review evaluated. The team also discussed the operation of procedures with staff, students and stakeholders, including those involved in providing clinically based learning.

1.11 The College undertakes a major evaluation of each programme at defined intervals (usually every five to seven years), termed programme review. The programme review process provides the Programme Committee with an opportunity to conduct a critical evaluation of its programme and all associated support, and to propose significant amendments, where appropriate. The programme review is conducted with reference to the guidelines set out in the document of Quality Assurance for Higher Education in Macau consultation meeting, 2014.

1.12 The College has held several periodic programme reviews, in 1997, 2002 and 2009. Recommendations from the reviewers conducting these reviews centred on improvements of the programme, which is reflected in the revision of policies and institutional management. The College has in place both internal and external monitoring mechanisms. The team saw evidence of follow-up action being taken as a result of recommendations by the various review teams. These actions include the recruitment of staff who are more appropriately qualified academically and professionally to teach the programmes; a systematic plan to enable current staff to attain relevant degrees; a librarian to assist in securing required up-to-date teaching and learning material and online databases; ensuring clinical supervisors are trained appropriately; the appointment of external examiners; the appropriate distribution of staff responsibilities between teaching, clinical and research work; and the incorporation of evidence-based care teaching.

1.13 Internal monitoring is directed by the College policy guidelines, and College-level oversight is provided by the Academic Committee and College Board of Directors. Evaluation is based on data from subject teachers for each programme, which includes consideration of subject content and pedagogical issues, student progress and performance and feedback from clinical partners and students. Issues are raised for discussion at the Teachers' Meeting and the Clinical Teaching Group meeting and where appropriate,

modifications made to programme implementation with endorsement by the Academic Committee.

1.14 External monitoring is undertaken through the College Advisory Committee, membership of which comprises officers from the Macau government, relevant local experts and employers. International and regional experts from the UK, USA, Australia, Brazil and Hong Kong have been invited to reviews and have regularly provided recommendations for programme improvement, to which the College responds positively.

1.15 The Institutional Annual Report provides information on activities throughout the preceding year and serves as a monitoring mechanism for educational and practice quality. An analysis and response to the annual report identifies areas for improvement and therefore ensures continuous improvement of the programmes, which aims to provide students with a high quality learning experience. The report is submitted to the Tertiary Education Service Office, Macau for information. The review team found evidence of several examples of improvement in teaching and learning in the form of the Teacher Handbook, which aims to give clear guidelines on the teacher's roles and responsibilities; a clinical teaching appointment system set up to assign suitable nurses who have good clinical experience to support students during their clinical placements; and the establishment of the clinical teaching group to ensure adequate clinical placements for students to gain their practical experience. There is evidence that the feedback system between key personnel from the clinical areas and the College staff ensures clinical objectives are achieved and there is strong commitment from the clinical training institutions to providing a high quality clinical learning experience.

### **External examining**

1.16 External verification that the standards of the College's awards are being met is provided through the use of an external examining system. Appropriately qualified and experienced peers are appointed by the College to comment on the achievement of standards and affirm that standards are being met (see also paragraph 2.19).

1.17 The College has clearly defined, fit for purpose policies and procedures for the design, development, approval and review of its programmes of study. These policies and procedures are assiduously implemented at all levels and the College has sound institutional oversight of its academic standards. The team therefore concludes that **confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the academic standards of its awards.

## 2 The quality of learning opportunities

2.1 The College sets out a range of policies and processes for the management of student learning opportunities in the College Quality Assurance Handbook. These are supported by guidelines included in the Teacher Handbook, the Clinical Teaching Handbook and the Management Methods document. Ultimate responsibility for the quality of learning opportunities is held by the Academic Committee but the day-to-day operation of programmes is managed by the Programme Committee. The policies, procedures and guidelines set out by the College are generally sound and fit for purpose and allow for the effective management of the learning opportunities that enable students to achieve the programme learning outcomes and their intended awards.

2.2 The team evaluated the management of learning opportunities by reading relevant policies, procedures and guidelines as described in the previous paragraph. These were then tested through an analysis of committee meeting minutes and through discussion with staff, students and stakeholders.

### Learning and teaching

2.3 The Academic Committee of the College monitors the development of teaching, the quality of programmes, and the qualification of teachers. Teaching activities are managed by the Education Department and supported by the Research Management and Development Department, Nursing and Health Education Research Centre. Quality of teaching and learning is further supported by the library, Information Technology Division and Logistics Division of the General Administrative Department.

2.4 The review team found evidence that the units and divisions mentioned in 2.3 are highly functional and work cohesively to maintain and enhance the quality of teaching and learning. Students affirm the satisfactory support they receive from the teachers, librarian, information technology staff, and counsellors.

2.5 The College takes steps to recruit suitably experienced staff who are appropriately qualified to deliver the curriculum. The College also demonstrates a commitment to staff mentoring and development. The Education Department supervises the quality of teaching through peer teaching review, new teacher teaching demonstration and student feedback.

2.6 The team solicited evidence from teachers and students that a comprehensive coaching and mentoring system is in place for both classroom and clinical teaching. Regular teaching workshops take place, where good practice can be shared. Staff exchanges are also arranged to enable staff to experience alternative approaches to teaching and learning. Overall, the team concludes that the wide range of staff development opportunities facilitated by the College, which enable effective professional and personal development, is **good practice**.

2.7 The team notes that the College's long-term plan is to achieve institutional accreditation in order to expand nursing programmes at postgraduate level. In this context it becomes more prominent and essential to enhance quality learning and teaching by developing a stronger link between teaching and research. The College has well established research activity amongst its staff and the team saw examples of a range of funded research projects being undertaken by the College. However, the team was not able to ascertain that there is strong integration of research in teaching. The College may therefore wish to explore greater flexibility in start-up opportunities, seeding research money and other forms of research support for newly recruited teachers. It would also be beneficial to explore ways of

engaging undergraduate students in the research process, for instance by funding undergraduate student helpers in research processes.

2.8 Evaluation of programmes by employers and graduates identifies creativity and critical thinking as an area for development. This reflects an urgent and global requirement for generic capabilities of graduates across disciplines. The College has developed 11 programme intended learning outcomes, incorporated in six core competencies for students in the Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme, which are intended for implementation in academic year 2016-2017. The review team noted that personal development, such as lifelong learning, knowledge-seeking behaviour and self-reflection, is included as one of the core competencies.

2.9 The College has widely introduced web-based teaching and is in the process of migrating its virtual learning environment to a platform more suited to interactive online learning. The review panel received a brief demonstration of the systems and noticed that their use is generally limited to uploading of information and enhancing communication among the teachers and students. With the proliferation of nursing knowledge and for pedagogical reasons, web-based teaching is rapidly developing in higher education. The College will want to consider the potential benefits of more advanced web-based learning, and other in-classroom educational technology that enables more interaction in classroom teaching, such as hand-held remote devices.

### **Student support and development**

2.10 The College has a comprehensive plan for student support, which is in line with its three-in-one policy of Professional Education, Holistic Education and General Education.

2.11 The Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme has revised the curriculum by merging subjects, increasing the use of tutorials, and increasing the use of simulated training. The College is still working to reduce the number of contact hours to 15 hours per week to enhance the student opportunities for holistic development.

2.12 A formal class adviser system is in place to provide guidance and academic support to students. Class advisors plan and organise holistic education, identify problems that students may be experiencing and help them to find solutions. They also work with class representatives and subject representatives to help them to establish mutual cooperation and support among students. Students are positive about the high level of support provided by their class advisors. Students are encouraged to participate in the extracurricular activities, such as theme talks, clubs, the Students' Union, exchanges and social services. There is evidence that almost all students are engaged in at least one club and most club activities are supported and advised on by teachers.

2.13 In 2013 the College established the Benevolence Education Centre. The functions of the Centre are to provide academic counselling and support, including services on study skills, academic writing, personal counselling, life skill training, emotional and financial support, physical training, aesthetic development, overseas exchange and site visits. Staff and students are very positive about the work of the Centre and the team saw evidence that the Centre is active, fully functional and well managed by a vibrant team of counsellors. It is clear that the work of the Centre is making a positive contribution to supporting students' learning and, in particular, their wider social development. The team considers that the extensive range of support for student learning, in particular the work of the Benevolence Education Centre, is **good practice**.

2.14 The College has adopted a biliteracy and trilingualism language policy in order to prepare graduates for work in an increasingly internationalised context. It has recruited

English teachers and a translator to support teaching in English. The Language Promotion group has been set up to strengthen staff ability in the use of English, with innovative strategies such as the use of an English day each week when everyone attempts, as far as possible, to communicate in English. An English proficiency assessment is required for all students before graduation. Twenty-one percent of course assessment is in English. The current English requirement at admission is fairly low at a score of 400 in the Test of English as Foreign Language Institutional Testing Programme (TOFEL ITP), although a preparatory English programme is provided to those who scored less than 400. The College may wish to review the minimum English requirement for applicants in the light of its plans to increase the use of English for teaching and assessment on its programmes.

2.15 There is a mixture of English and Chinese (Cantonese and Mandarin) used in both teaching, and in assessment in some subjects. While recognising the contextual drive for pursuing the trilingualism policy, the practice has the potential to create confusion and to add to the teaching and learning burden for teachers and students. Currently, the language of delivery is chosen by the teacher delivering the subject and students are not always given formal notice of the language of delivery with sufficient advance notice. The team therefore **recommends** that the College should explicitly publicise the language of teaching and assessment for each subject.

2.16 The College has set up a comprehensive and well organised clinical placement programme. Students at different stages of clinical practice are supervised by College clinical supervisors or nursing preceptors. There is evidence of excellent communication and networking with Kiang Wu Hospital and the Hac Sa Wan Health Centre, one of the health centres of the Health Bureau of Macau. Students are well supported by clinical partners, alumni and members of the Nurses Association of Macau, and are given effective opportunities to achieve defined learning outcomes. The Clinical Teaching Group ensures that clinical placements are well organised and matched to student learning needs. The group provides a formal means of communication between the placement areas and the College, but there is also regular communication on an individual level between staff of the College and staff in clinical areas. The highly effective strategies for networking and communication between the College and clinical practice is **good practice**.

2.17 The input and networking with other health-related disciplines is limited, although doctors, traditional Chinese medicine practitioners and physiotherapists are involved in some teaching sessions. The review team recognises that there is limited opportunity for including inter-professional education in the curriculum, due to the lack of medicine, pharmacy, and allied health training in Macau. The College realises the need to develop more interprofessional education and collaborative practice with students from other health care disciplines to create a more flexible healthcare workforce through greater socialisation, teamwork and collegiality among health care professionals. The team therefore **recommends** that the College should explore alternative strategies to providing opportunities for interprofessional learning.

## **Assessment**

2.18 Assessment aims to evaluate students' achievement of learning outcomes and the effectiveness of the programme in preparing future practitioners. A variety of assessment methods are used and the setting of each assessment is in accordance with the subject objectives. A schedule of subject assessments is set by the teaching team and made known to the students. Assessment criteria and the marking schemes for seminar, oral presentation and clinical study are clearly defined. This allows students to have a clear indication of areas to be examined and the level they are expected to achieve. The teachers and students whom the team met were aware of the policy for re-assessment and retaking subjects but there is some inconsistency between their understanding and the printed reassessment

guideline. For example, the team learned that a mark of at least 30 per cent was required to be eligible for a reassessment opportunity, while also being informed that the Examination Committee had discretion to agree a reassessment opportunity, taking into account aspects such as student learning attitudes and classroom behaviour. The review team **recommends** that the College should clarify the criteria for reassessment of subjects and ensure that these are explicitly set out in the regulations for the programme.

2.19 External examiners are appointed by the College to provide external verification of internal assessment decisions and to comment on the quality of teaching and learning. External examiners with appropriate academic and clinical expertise are appointed by the College. Guidance for the appointment and support of external examiners, together with a role description, are set out in the College Management Methods document. Reports made by external examiners to the College are presented at the Teachers' Meeting and are considered by the Academic Committee. The team saw evidence of careful consideration of external examiner comments and of appropriate responses to their recommendations.

2.20 The Examination Committee considers the marks and grades of each student and recommends the award, including degree classification. External examiners are invited to attend Examination Committee meetings in addition to internal markers.

### **Student engagement in quality assurance**

2.21 Procedures for communication with students are published in the College Quality Assurance Handbook. Student feedback about teaching and learning is achieved through various formal and informal channels. Students feed back about teaching directly to teachers, class advisers and the Programme Leader. They are also able to provide feedback through the class representatives, subject representatives, or the Students' Union.

2.22 Formal channels for providing feedback include the completion of online feedback questionnaires on individual subjects. The feedback questionnaire is anonymous. Students usually complete the questionnaire by the end of the teaching period. On receiving the questionnaires, the Education Department analyses the comments and gives feedback to respective subject teachers and Programme Leaders.

2.23 Class representatives are members of the Programme Committee, with meetings conducted once per semester. Students whom the team met are satisfied with these channels and find their voice being heard and taken seriously by the College. For example, the College explored new clinical venues in English-speaking countries, such as Singapore and the USA, after receiving a request from the student body.

### **Student achievement**

2.24 Student achievement is underpinned by the recruitment and careful selection of suitable candidates and faculty staff. At the institutional level, student achievement is measured through the number of students successfully graduating from the programme and gainfully employed, as well as their progression to further study. At the individual level, student achievement is determined by feedback from employers regarding graduate competency as beginning practitioners; this is set against their academic performance while undertaking the study programme.

2.25 The College has in place a recruitment and selection strategy with the aim of selecting good quality candidates for the programme. The approach includes career talks, video presentations, an entrance examination and face-to-face interview with pre-determined evaluation criteria. To operationalise the College's globalisation plan, English proficiency is

one of the admission criteria. The attrition rate of students in the Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme in the last five years is less than seven per cent in each academic year.

2.26 The team evaluated student achievement by examining documentation and statistics such as the student exit survey and progression and achievement statistics. The team also held direct discussions with key personnel from the main employers and from professional associations.

2.27 Statistics showed a high level of employment within three months of graduation and 10-20 per cent of Bachelor of Science in Nursing graduates pursue further studies at postgraduate level within three years of graduation. Several graduates are currently pursuing postgraduate studies, either master's or PhD programmes. Many graduates are later recruited to be clinical supervisors. Alumni of the College have received recognition and distinguished awards locally and internationally and many hold senior positions in governmental agencies responsible for setting policy direction. There is a high level of commitment and extensive informal networking between the College and graduates working in the various clinical training institutions. The achievement of high levels of graduate employment and the proportion of graduates pursuing further study is **good practice**.

2.28 Semester Grade Point Average (SGPA) is calculated at the end of each term, leading to Grade Point Average (GPA) upon graduation. Records indicate that 774 students have graduated from the various iterations of the nursing programme since 2005, of which 497 are from the Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme, 214 from the Bachelor of Science in Nursing (Supplementary) programme, 47 from the Postgraduate Diploma in Advanced Nursing programme and 16 from the Master of Nursing Science programme. The following table shows the numbers of enrolment and graduates of the Bachelor of Science in Nursing class 2006 to class 2010. The proportion of students achieving the intended award for this programme is high and demonstrates a generally improving trend, with the most recent figure for the class 2010 graduates indicating exceptional levels of achievement.

<b>Class</b>	<b>Number enrolled</b>	<b>Number graduated from class (per cent %)</b>
Class 2006	56	50 (89%)
Class 2007	49	40 (82%)
Class 2008	50	46 (92%)
Class 2009	52	45 (87%)
Class 2010	57	55 (96%)

Table: Bachelor of Science In Nursing enrolment and graduation rates 2006-10 entry year

2.29 In addition to their academic programmes, students are actively taking on leadership roles in the extracurricular activities as well as engaging in overseas exchange. Nursing students won a debating competition for the first time in 2015. The team notes that the College produces its own journal publications, which provides a ready opportunity for staff to engage in publication. The College may also wish to consider encouraging students to publish their work in these journals where it is of an appropriate standard.

2.30 Stakeholders provide favourable accounts of graduates' professional ethics, integrity, communication and team work. At the same time, there was a view that critical thinking and creativity abilities could be strengthened. The College is taking this issue

seriously and has taken steps to address it through the development of various pedagogical initiatives (see paragraph 2.8).

2.31 Taking into account the good levels of academic achievement, coupled with the high levels of graduate employment and progression to further learning, the team formed the view that graduates are achieving intended learning outcomes and are developing wider graduate skills that are welcomed and valued by the graduates themselves, their employers and other key stakeholders.

2.32 There is evidence of an extensive range of support for student learning, in particular the rich human and equipment resources and the work of the Benevolence Centre. The College has effective systems for managing the quality of learning opportunities. The team therefore concludes that **confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the quality of the learning opportunities available to students.

### 3 Published Information

3.1 The College publishes information for prospective students, current students, staff and stakeholders, such as those providing clinical placements or employing graduating students. Information is published in print format and online via an intranet, a virtual learning environment and on the web. The College has a public-facing website that is available in Chinese and English.

3.2 The team evaluated the currency, accuracy and usefulness of information by examining published documents, examining policies for managing information and through discussions with staff, students and external stakeholders.

3.3 The College's website provides clear and helpful information about recruitment and admission to its programmes, teaching and learning approaches, research and scholarly activity and College facilities, including those for clinical practice. There are also links from the website to the Students' Union, Benevolence Education Centre and the library. The website is well maintained and contains information that is relevant, up-to-date and well signposted. Students and stakeholders whom the team met confirmed that the website is accessible and contains information that is both clear and helpful.

3.4 Programme information such as student handbooks, subject-related information and presentations is provided to students on the virtual learning environment, which is accessible both onsite and offsite. Use of the virtual learning environment is monitored. Students were clear that the virtual learning environment is a primary source of information to support their studies. Given that students are often offsite on clinical placements or are part-time, the accessibility of the virtual learning environment is widely valued. However, the College has recognised the limitations of its current virtual learning environment and is in the process of transferring to a new one that will allow a wider and more active range of learning materials to be available.

3.5 Staff information, predominantly in the forms of a Teacher Handbook, the Management Methods document, Quality Assurance Handbook and a Clinical Teaching Handbook, are available on the College intranet. It is clear to the team from its discussions with staff, and from examining the handbooks and other information, that the guidance provided is comprehensive in its coverage. It is also detailed, appropriate and clear.

3.6 The currency and accuracy of published information is managed according to the nature of the information and where it is published. Guidelines for the management of publications and printed materials are set out in the Management Methods document. All web-published information is regularly checked by the head of the President's Office to see that it remains up to date. An annual review of information is undertaken to ensure continued accuracy and relevance.

3.7 The review team concludes that **confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the information it produces about its higher education provision.

## 4 Quality enhancement

4.1 The strategic drive for enhancing the quality of learning opportunities is located in the College's Ten Year Plan 2015-2025, which identifies four developmental strategies and eight corresponding strategic goals. These relate to academic and professional development, staff development, research development, student development, academic and professional support, optimising student resource and nurturing of nursing talents, and integration of teaching, research and social service, as well as regional and international cooperation. All of these goals impact on the quality of learning opportunities for students.

4.2 The team evaluated the College's approach to enhancing quality by reading key documents, including the College Ten Year Plan 2015-2025, policy documents, minutes of key committees, notably the Academic Committee, and analysing monitoring reports, including the College Annual Quality Report. The team held discussions with students, key stakeholders and staff to enable them to understand how the College takes forward its strategic intentions.

4.3 The College has in place a range of monitoring and review processes, which enable it to identify and act upon opportunities for enhancing the quality of student learning opportunities. The Board of Directors, President and Senior Management Team work to key performance indicators and are provided with an appropriate range of management information data to support decision making. Quality enhancement is also achieved through analysis of sources of evaluation from stakeholders, with appropriate follow-up actions.

4.4 In addition to the learning opportunities incorporated in the regular programme, the College continues to explore its approach to the provision of learning opportunities and to expand the scope of learning for students. Opportunities are sought for students to gain exposure to different practices and to visit healthcare facilities within and outside Macau. Sponsorships are made available for exchange in other institutions with recognised study credits.

4.5 The team found many examples of quality enhancement initiatives that have been or are currently being pursued. The following paragraphs outline several examples.

4.6 Establishment of the Benevolence Education Centre (see paragraph 2.13) to provide integrated and comprehensive personal support, advice and guidance as well as to encourage team spirit among students and foster their independence. The work of the Centre is widely valued by staff and students, and stakeholders recognise the impact the Centre has on the development of social and employability-related graduate skills.

4.7 The approach to learning and teaching has been modified to accommodate a required reduction in clinical learning hours. This has been achieved through the strengthening of laboratory teaching and learning pedagogy. To enhance students' critical reasoning skills, a simulation scenario-based teaching and learning strategy was introduced in a steady incremental way. The teacher-student ratio for clinical teaching is progressively decreased over the four years of the programme from 1:10 in year one to 1:2 or 1:3 in year four, recognising that students will require more intensive supervision to perform higher function roles. This approach smoothes graduate transition to beginning practitioner upon graduation. Reduction of teaching hours also facilitates students' self-reflection and self-directed learning.

4.8 In anticipation of the steady increase in the number of students and nursing manpower needs, funding has been put aside to strengthen the College infrastructure by expanding teaching and learning facilities on a new campus, in addition to improving the quality and number of staff in the College. Expansion of library resources, especially in

e-learning database and internet platforms, together with the new campus development, enhances the quality of learning, which in turn contributes towards enhancing the overall College programmes.

4.9 A Language Promotion Group was established in 2005 to fulfil the mission of bilingual education. In the subsequent year, biliteracy (Chinese and English) and trilingualism (Cantonese, Mandarin and English) was adopted in teaching, learning and assessment activities. Although the policy specifies that the process is primarily based on the nature of the academic subjects, professional requirements, language habits, competence of students and teachers, level of difficulties and practicability, there are some inconsistencies in the language of delivery in some subjects. Staff and students indicated that there are no clear guidelines on the language used as it depends on the comfort level of the teachers. For instance, electronic slide presentations may be in English, but the mode of delivery in Cantonese. Nevertheless, the College has taken proactive action to introduce the number of subjects to be taught in English progressively, from seven to 15 (43 per cent) of the total number of subjects in the Bachelor of Science in Nursing programme in the coming five years. Additionally, a budget has been set aside to support English language training for teaching staff in order to increase their English language proficiency.

4.10 These examples clearly indicate that there is a strong commitment to improving the learning opportunities for students continuously, and that this commitment is led by the most senior levels of the College management and is underpinned by a strong strategic drive. The team concludes that **confidence** can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of the enhancement of the quality of learning opportunities available to students.

## 5 Conclusions

5.1 The team reviewed a wide range of documentary evidence supplied by the College in advance of the review visit. The team also had the opportunity to meet with senior staff, teaching staff, administrative staff, students, graduates, clinical placement providers and employers.

5.2 The College has a clear and strong strategic direction which is well understood by staff and to which all are committed. There is clear evidence that the College is a reflective and evaluative organisation and is committed to enhancing the learning opportunities it provides for its students continuously.

5.3 Graduates are well prepared for their intended sphere of employment. They achieve intended learning outcomes and the range and level of academic and professional skills are valued by their employers.

5.4 On the basis of their evaluation of the evidence the team concludes that confidence can reasonably be placed in the soundness of the College's current and likely future management of its provision in the four judgement areas: the academic standards of its awards; the quality of the learning opportunities available to students; the information it produces about its higher education provision; and the enhancement of the quality of learning opportunities available to students.

## 6 Institutional response to the review findings

The Kiang Wu Nursing College of Macau (the College) welcomes the Review Report from QAA. The report of the Review Team (the team) acknowledges the College's high quality student learning experience, which echoes its mission and role, underpinned by good and effective support systems for students. The team also highlights the College's overall commitment in safeguarding the standards and assuring enhancement of the quality of student learning experiences.

The College is delighted by the very encouraging comments made about the College's good practices in providing a wide range of staff development opportunities and its highly effective strategies for networking and communication between the College and clinical practice partners. The College is also praised for providing an extensive range of support for student learning, in particular with the work of the Benevolence Education Centre. Moreover, the College is commended for having achieved a high level of graduate employment and the proportion of graduates pursuing further education.

The College believes that quality enhancement is a continuous process. The scoping visit by QAA in 2014 provided the College with insight into the review process and set the path for the review visit. In preparing the self-evaluation document, the College conducted a vigorous institutional self-evaluation six months before the review visit. The preparations provided the opportunity to self-appraise the strategies and policies in place and to identify areas or issues that have to be addressed in the light of changing circumstances and comments of previous reviews. Throughout the planning process, all staff and students were involved. The College is pleased that the team has placed confidence in the College's current and likely future management of the academic standards of its awards, of the quality of the learning opportunities available to students, of the information it produces about its higher education provision, and the enhancement of the quality of learning opportunities available to students.

The College is thankful for the identification of areas for future attention. These will be addressed and an action plan will be submitted in June 2016. The recommendations will enable the College to direct effort in targeted areas and ensure that appropriate actions be taken to address those items. The College affirms the recommendations to publicise the language of teaching and assessment for each subject, and to re-examine the criteria for reassessment of subjects and ensure that the criteria are explicitly set out in the programme document. The College will explore strategies to provide inter-professional learning for students as recommended by the team. It is strongly believed that addressing these recommendations will strengthen the quality processes in ways that will directly enhance student learning experience.

In conclusion, the College is grateful to the team for its advice and encouragement, and proud to have been one of the few higher education institutions in Macau to undertake the Institutional Audit process. The report will reinforce the continuous enhancement of the educational quality and environment for all College students, and the College is pleased to share this review report and this response with all stakeholders, including prospective students.

4 February 2016

## Glossary

### **Academic quality:**

Those factors that determine the learning experience of students, including the quality of teaching and learning, the provision of learning resources, the planning and delivery of programmes of study and levels of academic support and guidance.

### **Academic standards:**

Academic standards are defined in terms of the expected levels of achievement of students that reflect the acquisition of knowledge, the development of capability and the exercise of intellectual skills by students.

**ADRI:** A method for assessing 'fitness for purpose' in audit. It is based on four questions:

- **Approach:** What is the institution's purpose?
- **Deployment:** How does the institution achieve its purpose?
- **Results:** What evidence is there that the purpose is being achieved?
- **Improvement:** What processes are in place for improvement?

### **Annual Monitoring:**

Procedure for providing an annual account of the experience of delivering academic programmes or the provision of academic services. Annual reports normally include information about student achievements and may comment on the evaluation of courses and modules.

### **Review Coordinator:**

The coordinator is appointed by QAA to manage the review programme and to act as the liaison between QAA, the review team and the College. The coordinator's role is to oversee the schedule for the review programme, the selection and preparation of review team members, the composition of review teams, the planning and implementation of the review visit, the editing and publication of reports and the oversight of follow-up activity. The Review Coordinator may also act as a reviewer where appropriate.

### **Audit trails:**

A process that the review team may conduct to investigate aspects of an institution's quality assurance processes in depth, involving evidence from subject departments and academic support teams, or by reviewing particular issues of concern at individual programme or areas of academic support level in the light of the findings of previous quality audits, or if there are particular issues that require further investigation. The purpose of such investigations is to illustrate the effectiveness of institutional policies and procedures.

### **Fitness for purpose:**

An approach to quality assurance that provides confirmation that institutions have appropriate procedures in place to meet their stated roles and missions and to secure the quality and academic standards of their academic programmes.

### **Institutional representative:**

The member of staff identified by the institution to act as facilitator for the review. He/she will be the principal point of contact for the Review Coordinator and will be available during the review visit, to assist with any questions or requests for additional documentation.

### **Self-evaluation document:**

A self-evaluation report by an institution. The submission should include information about the institution as well as an assessment of the effectiveness of its quality systems.

**Outcomes-based education:**

An approach to the design and delivery of academic programmes that focuses on what students will achieve and be able to do once they have completed their studies. It combines the acquisition of knowledge with the application of skills and capabilities.

**Periodic review:**

A regular health check on an academic programme or group of programmes. Periodic review normally occurs every five or six years and covers areas such as the continuing relevance of the programme, the currency of the curriculum and reference materials, the employability of graduates and the overall performance of students. Periodic review is one of the main processes whereby institutions can continue to assure themselves about the academic quality and standards of their awards.

**Quality enhancement:**

Policies and procedures adopted by institutions to bring about systematic improvements in the quality of the learning experience of students and to enrich course curricula.

**Validation:**

The process by which an institution ensures that its academic programmes meet expected academic standards and that students will be provided with appropriate learning opportunities. It may also be applied to circumstances where a degree-awarding institution gives approval for its awards to be offered by a partner institution or organisation.

**QAA1495 - R4839 - Mar 16**

© The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education 2016  
Southgate House, Southgate Street, Gloucester GL1 1UB  
Registered charity numbers 1062746 and SC037786

Tel: 01452 557050  
Web: [www.qaa.ac.uk](http://www.qaa.ac.uk)